

General Notes

From previous discussions, there was concern about the word count. There are several opportunities for copy editing to reduce wordiness. Example: Line 37: Opportunity for word count reduction. "... showcasing and exposing human impacts on local and global ecosystems to audiences of all ages." Example: "In order to" -> "To". While I offer some suggestions for edits and ask for additional details, I try to balance this with opportunities to balance word count. The re-wording is a suggestion, not an obligation. Please make sure that your voice is represented.

Thank you very much, we have taken your advice and attempted to reduce word count while also ensuring our voice is still represented. We have also added additional example quotes for motive in the supplementary file.

Abstract:

Please review and revise the abstract to ensure that the abstract matches the take home message from the article. The first sentence isn't explored so much as the perception has changed over time as a result of political discourse and media. Consider breaking the second sentence into two, as its length confounds the take home message and the journey you took to get there

We have broken the sentence into two and it now reads better. Thank you for your suggestion.

Manuscript

Line 22-25: Recommendation to edit to something like "The public perception and societal importance of anthropogenic impacts on the environment..." and to balance word adds:

Line 23 and on: "This overall perception is shaped and reflected by political discourse and news media, as well as creative and narrative media including blockbuster movies, television series, literature, and video games illustrating climate and environmental change." Previously, it was unclear whose perception and anthropogenic impacts on or of what and there was a missing link to video games.

Thank you very much for the suggestion. We have edited these few lines with your recommendations.

Line 28: What concepts? Academic? Learning?

We have clarified learning concepts

Line 28: To save word count from above: Recommendation to cut to something like "Research on Earth and environmental science representation in video games is still growing (Clements et al., 2022; Hut et al., 2019; McGowan & Alcott, 2022; McGowan & Scarlett, 2021), with many games set in environments inspired by real-world locations, events, and processes, making them ideal for teaching environmental concepts."

Thank you for the suggestion, we have broadly edited the sentence to your recommendation as follows: *"Research into Earth and environmental science's representation in video games is still a growing field (Clements et al., 2022; Hut et al., 2019; McGowan & Alcott, 2022; McGowan & Scarlett, 2021), with many video games inspired by real world settings, events or locations, making them ideal for teaching environmental features, processes and interactions."*

Line 34: The transition between paragraphs is a bit hard. Recommendation to bring the sentence that starts in 38 to the top of this to connect climate change to the vastness of Pokémon. Then go into Pokémon is the largest media franchise..." For example: "Since climate change is a global challenge, Pokémon is uniquely positioned to promote climate change awareness, as it is available in 192 countries (ThePokémonCompany, 2022)."

We have edited the end and beginning of the two paragraphs to try and make them flow better.

Line 40: Recommendation to drop "In doing so,..." There isn't a clear callback to what you're referencing. Alternatively, recommendation to provide a little exposition of "To explore Pokémon's integration of climate change knowledge we ask 1)" fill in and add your questions such that the reader clearly understands why you're asking these questions, though you've done a great job setting up Pokémon's potential the "THL" should be clear here.

We have included the recommendation and hopefully now streamlined the sentence to better clarify the objectives of the manuscript.

Line 45: Please clarify "this" since it's the start of a new section to something like "We played the main series Pokémon games released from 1996 to 2023 and thematically analyzed driving narratives and instances of anthropogenic impacts in the games to evaluate evolving anthropogenic and environmental impact themes." Line 48: "Representative quotes were collated from each generation of 48 games by interrogating game scripts and quotes and qualitatively coding them into thematic categories, illustrated in Fig. 1. Examples can be found at link." Previously, it wasn't explicit that you had done thematic coding, the figure wasn't referenced.

We have better clarified the thematic coding and almost focused on limiting some of the unnecessary wording to limit our word count.

Line 49: Please review the table. There are missing titles, check consistency of punctuation and capitalization, etc. I would also recommend trying to find a couple more examples just to strengthen your argument and illustrate that there isn't a "just one" example. Consider adding a column to elucidate how you find/incorporated the paragraph starting at 103 in your analysis, right now it feels detached.

We have now reviewed the table and included additional examples to all of the games noted.

Figure 1 description is incredibly long at ~100 words. Also, there are no numbered IPCC assessment reports referenced. "Original release timeline of main-series Pokémon games and the evolution of global discourse surrounding climate change evidenced by environmental events since 1990 (e.g., climate meetings and agreements). The qualitatively coded themes of the antagonists' motives are highlighted in green."

We have amended the figure caption so it is now more concise. The numbered IPCC reports are also included above the timeline.

Line 60: A bit redundant. "The modern geologic era is often referred to as the Anthropocene due to widespread human impacts across geologies and ecosystems, including climate change."

We believe that a sentence stating this is needed in order when defining the Antro-Pokécene in order to ensure all readers know what we are reference from.

Paragraph starting at 65: Recommendation to review flow, since the good THL for this paragraph is in the sixth line of this paragraph in which the connection between the themes in the game match the decade. But, it's split up by the sentence "These games coincided...", which is a great lead in to the final paragraph that builds towards the introduction of climate change.

Done.

Line 77: "morally ambiguous" is a bit confusing here because it becomes more elucidated in the second sentence.

In this new revision we have edited the sentences into one to allow for a better flow.

The paragraph starting at 77: I see that this paragraph is the transition between no climate change to more climate change; I would recommend stating that "transition phase" explicitly (however you would want to word it).

We have edited the beginning of this paragraph to read as follows: *"As global climate discourse proliferated in the late 2000s and 2010s, the franchise grew and transitioned to better represent the nuance and complexity of environmental change."*

Line 80: Consider: "...to a beautifully and unspoiled state by wiping out the population. The sentence: "While arguably..." doesn't add additional context that greatly expands the previous line and the thought is concluded in the next sentence "This storyline mirrors..."

As discussed above, we have now edited the sentences into one to allow for better flow.

Line 82-83: Referring to "Without being sanctimonious..." Can you add a couple of words of context to how the player is to question the ethics? Is it just through exposure/osmosis of thought or is there a choice/action that the player must grapple with?

We have included an additional statement to address. *"Without being sanctimonious, this concept being presented by the game's antagonist inherently causes players to question the ethics of calls to reduce human populations as a viable solution to climate change through exposure and discussion of the subject, they may not otherwise be witness to."*

Line 85-87: Are there examples that pre-date the game to illustrate that the game reflects society? The current example is nearly a decade later.

We are trying to provide direct evidence for the games and society demonstrating similar goals. We refer to the UN title and IPCC reports as they are explicitly cited as a community efforts to combat climate change.

Paragraph starting on Line 90: I would recommend dropping "The former region," and "latter region" because you mention them two sentences prior and you can just say the name. I read it originally as "Alola was formerly known or existed as X". It also doesn't have any cited connection to the real-life analog.

We have made this edit.

Paragraph starting on 103 is excellent. Having it in the previous section might expand the lines of thought, since the final section title and placement implies "conclusions" whereas this paragraph is giving additional discussion.

Thank you very much for the positive reception to this paragraph. We have moved it into the previous section as suggested.

Paragraph starting on Line 115 feels like a departure from the purpose of this piece. Briefly linking it to the clash between real-life climate anxiety can link back to your driving questions. Rather than pursuing a new thesis through the exploration of nihilistic games starting in Line 119 with “These hopeful scenarios”, consider using this space to link to real life discourse. That would lead well into the proceeding sentence. Same sentiment with “Games and global pheno...” rather than introducing new media, land the Pokémon thesis because the resolution of these questions should be stronger..

We appreciate the suggestion of linking back to real life discourse. We do however believe that including the contrasting post-apocalyptic narratives to Pokémon is of value though, in an attempt to highlight that Pokémon is unique in its appreciation of the natural world.

We have now edited the text to better refer back to the questions initially posed by stating:

“Pokémon has progressed to present a more hopeful balance between humans and the environment over the past few decades. In doing so they represent how popular media has come to mirror public discourse and society aiming for a better planet, albeit whilst presenting moral dilemmas through antagonists actions.”

We have also removed the statement referring to nihilistic games.

Line 115-116: Is this confirmed or discussed elsewhere? This is a point made in the intro, but not throughout the middle of the manuscript. Similarly, the primary sentence on Line 116-118 is a claim that isn't backed up with citations.

We have now provided the Rangel et al. 2022 reference referring to the scope of Pokémon in education.