Interactive comment on “Volcanoes in video games: The portrayal of volcanoes in Commercial-Off-The-Shelf (COTS) video games and their learning potential” by Edward George McGowan and Jazmin Paris Scarlett

Jazmin Scarlett
j.scarlett-2014@hull.ac.uk

Received and published: 23 October 2020

Dear Kayla,

Many thanks for your comments and we are glad you enjoyed the paper. Ed and I have discussed what we shall do in regards to your suggestions:

1. We feel that your suggestion for a more substantive data analysis, whilst it would add another dimension to this paper, is beyond the scope of this study. However, we will take this into consideration for future studies.

- The histogram suggestion of the number of occurrences of various volcanic features is a similar suggestion to reviewer 2’s idea of a summary table. We will therefore, take this on board and add this to the paper.
- On the suggestion of scoring, we believe this would be subjective. We have done something similar on our blog posts and even then, it has been purely based on our own personal opinions. This would not be appropriate for a peer reviewed paper.
- We do like the idea of crowdsourcing the help to generate a more comprehensive list of COTS games that feature volcanism. We did try to do this before this paper was written however, we did not get any engagement. Now that we do have this paper, we will attempt to generate interest in making this a more collaborative effort and start this process on a blog post, before expanding into a peer reviewed paper.

2. This is an excellent suggestion that we had not considered previously. We shall take this on board and provide figures with real world volcanic features to visually compare to the video game counterparts.

3. Whilst this is an interesting and valid suggestion, this would perhaps be better suited for a separate paper with the findings linked to this paper. We have previously considered speaking with game developers and ask such questions that you have suggested for future work.

- Ed and I are unsure on our stance on whether games should be more realistic or not. This would depend on the developer’s reasonings and introduce a degree of subjectivity.

I hope this is a satisfactory response to your comments, please do let us know if you need further explanations.

Kind regards,

Jazmin Scarlett